

Indian Muslim Mothers and their Maternal Subjectivity

Syeda Nagma ABIDI

PhD Scholar, Ambedkar University, Delhi, India, nagma.abidi@gmail.com

ABSTRACT: Maternal subjectivity is defined in terms of emerging agency of a mother as a woman within the interface with her child. It entails engagement with the experience of motherhood and womanhood to define a sense of self. In psychoanalysis, this ground of interaction with the mother is seen as a key influencer to the evolution of one's identity much before the phase of oedipal complex. For many years, the mother-child relationship was understood from the child's perspective but in recent times, due recognition has been given to the Mother as a subject as well. This paper is an attempt to capture her voice to address her dilemmas and efforts to negotiate with the fragmented self within her to contribute to her emerging agency. Existing work around maternal subjectivity has a predominantly western lens, theoretical underpinnings have been taken from the work of Jessica Benjamin and Alison Stone, but the effort was to capture the voices of Middle class Muslim mothers of adolescent daughters. In the Indian context, Sudhir Kakar has worked extensively to explore Indian Psyche; however the realm of the Muslim mother's experience is still on nascent ground. It has been found that contemporary Indian Muslim mothers struggle in their efforts to sync their agency with conflict coming from their mothered experiences, and contemporary societal realities. Exploratory in its nature, data was collected through in-depth interviews conducted with 10 mothers. This paper was developed on the analysis of two interviews conducted as part of the larger research.

KEYWORDS: Maternal Subjectivity, Indian Muslim Mothers, Intersubjectivity, Maternal Negotiations

Introduction

“As I struggle, I write the script of my daughter's struggles.” - Gaiti

The origin of this paper is located in the narratives of the Muslim mothers who shared their stories of motherhood and reliving the experience with their mothers. The focus of base research is around trying to decipher 'how does the mothered experience seep into their mothering, whether it is a conscious process or does it happen unconsciously and how does a mother deal with it? 'My reflection while mothering my daughter was that unconsciously my mother would creep in to influence the way I would engage with her or the situation. It is at that time the earlier questions emerged and I began to ask myself - Where was 'I' located in this? Was 'I' being subsumed by the ideal of being a mother or was 'I' retaining something of mine as a woman – how was this whole process unfolding and how was it defining my identity? Thus began my parallel inquiry into others as to how do they negotiate womanhood with motherhood. This paper is an attempt to capture this negotiation. It looks into two distinct narratives of mothers interviewed and encompasses my own reflection to bring forth the self fragments and how they work together in relation to the milieu, both internal and external.

The western theorising around maternal subjectivity is a recent exploration, and there exists no common story. Sudhir Kakar and Katherine Kakar (2007) in fact proposed that if one has to talk about Indians then one would have to take on the Indic lens; taking this idea forward, if one has to talk about the Indian Muslim mothers then one would have to expand the lens to include what it means to be a Muslim, especially in an Indian subcontinent. Sudhir Kakar has worked intensely in the Indian context - therefore has deep reflections about Indian psyche; however one finds that he has predominantly worked within Hindu culture and not delved much into the Muslim woman psyche. This is recognised as a gap that one attempts to address in this paper. One's interiority is also used to explore the inner life of the Indian Muslim mother. To start with an acknowledgment that even though the Muslim mothers practice a monolithic religion, there exist influences of elements of geographical majoritarian culture in their lives. This is one of the elements of negotiation for them as they raise their daughters. As a disclaimer, one does not claim generalisability in this work, but hope exists that experiences brought forth may help while one engages with the experience of the Muslim mother in different spaces.

Maternal Subjectivity - The evolutionary journey of a mother from being an 'object' to 'subject'

A sense of self emerges post negotiation with both past and the present. "Subjectivity is defined in terms of affect of language, a product of power relations, and a psychical construction predicated on the repression of a prior multiplicity of drives, affect, and mental elements" (Stone 2012, 3) . While talking about maternal experience it is this and the realisation that a mother is not just a mother but is a person in her own right that allows us to understand the maternal subjectivity. The exploration around maternal subjectivity is a fairly recent one, only made possible when it was accepted that intersubjective relations exist between the mother and child. The theoretical realisation of intersubjectivity facilitated the researchers to look at dyadic relationships, especially of mother-child as relationship between two subjects and not between a subject and an object. The definition that resonates closely to the one used in this paper is given by Juhasz (2003) "... the aggregate of subject positions or "representations", experienced by woman who is a mother which includes those as a daughter". There is, thus, a recognition that there are multiple identities that she lives through and her sense of self actually emerges from a combination of all these and how they interact with each other.

Benjamin (1988; 1995; 2000; 2004) proposed that maternal feelings are meaningful when others recognise them inclusive of intention and action for self as well. She gave up the notion of identity but focused the attention on the multiplicity of self-representation in the course of development, and on the mechanisms by which they play off and later one another. These become critical in facilitating a demarcation between self and the other. Here lies the basis of the argument that a mother has multiple identities, one of which is being a mother. This recognition of how multiple identities interplay becomes a matter of inquiry. In fact, Benjamin argued that if mothers are denied subjective agency and fathers do not allow their daughters to identify with their agency then latter is most like to be submissively attached to the mother (Layton 2008). This then becomes a cyclic phenomenon with possibility of transmitting from generation to the other. Is this the only reason behind the need to understand maternal subjectivity? My proposition is that apart from the need to break the cyclic phenomenon of submissive attachment, there is also a need to respond to increasing number of mothers experiencing dilemmas and struggling with maternal ambivalence.

There are multiple positions that one operates from as a mother if one has to establish an identity of one's own. It would entail acknowledgement of existing ambivalent feelings along with childhood experiences of being mothered. The ambivalent feelings emerge when the historical notion of motherhood which revolves around self-sacrifice and selflessness comes into conflict with current desire to think about oneself and one's choices. Knowledge about maternal subjectivity helps to give rise to resilience that allows a mother to beneficially use the feelings of maternal ambivalence to negotiate between her own and her child's needs.

In order to understand maternal subjectivity one falls back onto psychoanalysis - the reason being that the field traces the origin of the patterns evident in adults into their childhood. As Stone (2012) shares, "Even though psychoanalysis seems to be destined to position the mothers as the background within which these formations took shape, it is psychoanalytic orientation towards childhood that ensures that mothers are treated as the daughters of their own mothers" (31). Each individual's psyche has a layered history and through psychoanalysis one is able to understand the past and present, and how one shapes the other. This understanding would enable one to capture the mothered experiences that a mother brings to her mothering (Van Buren 2007). It also allows us to recognise that the process of re-enacting the maternal past is in part a process of loss whereby making memory work and mourning an intrinsic part of maternity and a way to identify with others. In fact, Benjamin has contested the traditional psychoanalytic view that primary task of the individual development is a progressive process of becoming separate from and independent of others, particularly the mother. This shift in the lens facilitates a deeper exploration of the mother as a subject in her own right.

Other than Benjamin, Stone (2011; 2012) has also argued that in order to recognise one's maternal subject position, one would need to negotiate with the western cultural norms that typically reject maternal body relations. This would require one to go back to one's own mothered experiences to re-situate oneself as a participant in one's relation. "With own mother in past and daughter in present, the mother regains full subjectivity through becoming active in generating meaning from her maternal bodily experience" (Stone 2012, 33). The interpretative framework has been informed by the work of Stone and Benjamin and used to deconstruct the narrative of the mothers to locate their subjective position. It is said that the mother's present day mothering is shaped by her past experiences with her own mother as they remember and re-imagine them.

Maternal Subjectivity of the Indian Mother

In India, mothers and daughters often share a compassionate and empathetic connection, especially because she is aware of her daughter's fate in her family of marriage where she is expected to be adaptive. As a result, re-experiences the emotional conflicts of her own separation when aroused at time of daughter's marriage. There is, as a result, an increase in her indulgence and solicitude towards her daughter to prepare her for adulthood. This may come in conflict with her efforts to focus on herself. Expanding on the Indian context, Kakar & Kakar (2007) interprets the position of mother in the Indian psyche in two forms. One as a mother, a discrete self, and the other as a diffuse and archaic maternal figure. He strongly recommends viewing of Indian women through the Indic culture lens which has resulted in giving due recognition to the influence of Caste. In India, the interplay of Caste and Gender within the strong patriarchal society manifests in such a manner, whereby a Brahmin woman would find herself superior to a Vaishya male and a Muslim woman would find herself comparably lower than a Hindu woman in societal hierarchy. This is their social reality and many who are working on

the Indian woman psyche find themselves required to contend with this along with the twin ideologies - one that seeks to defend the traditional vision of Indian womanhood, and another that aims to be free from the inequities of religiously sanctioned patriarchies. This is also reflected within the dilemmas experienced by the modern Indian women as they make an ongoing attempt to reconcile traditional ideals with modern aspirations (Kakar 1981). Building on his proposition, it is recognised that in conversations with Muslim mothers this nuancing may exist and requires sensitive engagement as only then one may be able to extract the dilemmas and allow an understanding of their efforts of negotiation.

Representation of the Indian Muslim Mother

For this paper, of all the interviews conducted, two have been picked up whose dilemma may be said to be representative of the experiences predominant among contemporary middle class Muslim mothers. Gaiti and Faiza (both names changed) are women who are exposed to the dominant societal narrative and find themselves at the cusp where the traditional ideas of motherhood are challenged by their daughters and the concurrent notions of womanhood force them to examine the idea of motherhood from that lens for themselves and their daughters. As transmitters of traditions and values they find themselves re-interpreting the memories of their mothers to position themselves as mothers. What does the maternal experience mean to a mother, especially being a mother of a daughter? Are there moments when there exists dilemma between motherhood and womanhood, especially for contemporary mothers? Are there any moments when a mother explicitly experiences her own mother as 'the third' while mothering her daughter? Does she revisit her mothered experience while mothering? While all these questions can be seen as anchor to be explored with Muslim mothers, the context of contemporary India becomes relevant as well. While personal stories are being shared, these are located in particular times and places. Therefore, a brief context establishment of the time period is essential as it helps in locating these women in a certain socio-political environment. This is not done in this article explicitly but dedicated space has been given to it in the PhD research.

The mother and her experience is central to this work. There is recognition that there are multiple variables that influence because she is embedded in her society, raised in a particular family, and exposed to a particular culture. The interaction between and with all these variables unfolds a particular reality for her. Therefore, this needs to be scaffolded. Maternal experiences in reality is about relationship between mother and daughter. Since I am interested in the subjective experience of the mother, I take the liberty of evoking the mother's perspective. Foregrounding her experience and allowing her to share how she has experienced the reality around her and what has she chosen to take forward in her mothering and why? This can be best understood if this narrative is located within the realm of psychosocial and examined with a feminist lens. Each individual is unique and in line with the post modernistic viewpoint the realities are diverse and experience of psychosocial intermingle questioning the effort to generalise. The narrative that only science has access to objective truth is shifting. There is increasing acknowledgment of complexities involved in the lives and societies. Within postmodern theory, the rejection of objective truth and the argument that all perspectives, particularly those constructed across boundaries of time, culture and difference (gender, race, ethnicity, etc) are fundamentally out of proportion makes it difficult to reconcile the world views. There is therefore need to recognise the subjective experience. Also because people who are experiencing a feeling are best source of knowledge (Bondi, 2014). The method and the methodological tools therefore

chosen here are aimed to best fit the nature of questions examined. Taking on the feminist lens has given me the flexibility to take on methodological tools that are inclusive, and supports my contention that individual subjective experience is as much critical and we can learn from it as well. It allows for creating a relational space.

Within this larger framework, it was recognised that the research questions and the framework necessitated use of qualitative methods to be used. The primary data was to come through the interviews conducted. This research is not about numbers, but about the depth of the experience and therefore, it was decided to explore a range of 10-12 interviews. Mothers who self identified themselves as belonging to middle class with daughters who have attained adolescence were approached to be part of the study. These were women who had spent at least two decades of their life in the city of Delhi. The geographical demarcation was necessary considering the cultural diversity that exists within India. Hence, these were women whose families were located in North India (area identified to be above Deccan plateau for this work). These women were approached through word of mouth. A conversation around the research topic was conducted followed by query whether they would be interested in talking about their maternal experience. It is recognised that one may say that this may be problematic as it is a version of convenience sample for research. However, this snowball effect strategy was deliberately used as one was conscious of reaching out and including women who wanted to share their experience. A third of the interviewees were personally known to the researcher and others were approached through word of mouth by the people who were familiar with the research topic or those who had been interviewed. This allowed for ease in establishing rapport as the conversation required the participants to explore both their present and past.

Catherine Riessman's (2001, 2005) work on narrative analysis was used to support the identification of embedded themes. She highlighted that gaps exist in standard interviewing techniques and the natural manner of holding conversations. In order to address this gap, she suggests that it is required to give up the control and let the interviewee lead and follow their association. The interviews were transcribed into narratives and examination of these narratives led to a realisation that participants tend to respond in an internal flow in spite of questions asked by the interviewer. It is from this flow that themes were extracted to illustrate the negotiations by Gaiti and Faiza in their mothering in the paper.

I can be myself because my mother gave me the permission.

"I firmly believe that it is not so important to ask how much time was a mother able to spend with her daughter (child?) and what she did specifically in that time but what the mother did with her entire life. How did the mother take on the various aspects of life, what kind of treatment she took from people around her, what were her dreams and how did she go about them...all these the child remembers. The girls learn from this how to be a woman and, I suppose, the boys would learn how to treat a woman." - Gaiti 2016 in response to a question, what does it mean to be a mother?

Gaiti, positioned herself as a feminist who defined motherhood beyond the ideal definition of someone whose primary role was taking care of their child's needs throughout life. The subject is generally the centre who gives meaning to his or her experiences through multiple means of expression. Maternity challenges the sense of being a unified subject, along with one's capacities to speak and make meaning. This happens because one is desirous of returning to the relational context of one's early childhood. Even though not seeing her as a role model while growing up, it is much later that Gaiti realised that unconsciously her mother has a strong presence in her life. She recollects her mother sharing with her that she would have left her husband if only

she was more educated. It was as if she was aware that not being financially independent restricts her ability to take care of herself and the children. This feeling germinated perhaps in her harsh circumstances of living with a mother who worked in people's homes after her father's early death during her childhood. For Gaiti, the need to be financial specifically and independent generally has become integral as a woman – ability to be financially independent gives her a sense of security and personhood.

The picture that Gaiti paints of her mother is that of a woman who chose to prioritise her womanhood over motherhood. Even though she had left school when in 5th class, she took time out to educate herself while taking care of her children. At home, an Urdu magazine used to come in, which she would find time to read daily. She also identified support classes to go in evening, but when found that people there wasted time gossiping, she challenged them to appreciate the value of time. For Gaiti, her mother was someone who took time out for herself, challenging the norm of that time that for mothers it is their children who are their primary concern (This remains to be a concurrent expectation from mothers). Her mother was her anchor, *“All my unconsciousness knows about being a woman was learnt from my mother...Even though I wasn't close to her and my father was my teacher of the world, it's politics and the large philosophical questions, it is ultimately who she was that shapes me as a woman.”* The middle class mothers, these days when exposed to the 'modern position of autonomous subject' (Stone 2012) may have difficulty in reconciling with the traditional idea of motherhood. There are standards that are not just culturally supported but sometimes also promoted by the parenting industry. Donald Winnicott was one of the first to propose the idea of 'good-enough mother' as someone who is able to prioritise the needs of the child and yet able to keep oneself in the background to enable the child to individuate. This idea of a mother got embedded as an ideal when introduced, something that mothers continue to compare themselves with. Often the conflict may arise because one feels that one is not spending enough time with own daughter and it has negative impact on her. But as Gaiti shared earlier it is the quality of interaction that becomes enriching for both. It is the manner of one's life that creates a roadmap for the daughter and if a mother sees herself as a person then her daughter will do so the same. *“Motherhood for her was not a huge production so we did not...she did not give us choice of various food, she made food, and we could either eat it or not eat it... also we never got food before time. So if she was reading newspaper and it was not the time for dinner or lunch one could not hope to get a snack from the mother (laughs)”* She cooked for the family, took care of the house, but her life did not revolve around it. Gaiti's mother gave her permission to relegate cooking as a non-priority role of a mother and putting oneself in the priority list. This was so because she challenged the norm herself and thus allowing Gaiti an allowance to see it as a possibility. Traditions, however, continue their hold on the middle class woman's mind in that she views domestic and maternal obligations as central to her identity. This is true of the housewife as much as of the high profile career woman. Traditional norms which demand that a woman's first commitment is to her children and the second to her husband, and this does not seem to be influenced by a woman's educational or occupational status (Kakar & Kakar 2007). A woman takes on child-rearing as the primary role as soon as she becomes a mother. If the ideas of what you want for yourself are deeply entrenched, then they come in conflict with the assumptions that are laid out as a role of the mother. It is because Gaiti can fall back on her mother who challenged the norms of her times that she is able to negotiate her personhood with maternal self even though alternate mother figures such as her sister in law and mother in law that she has included in her daughter's life provide a contrast to her daughter.

Our society attaches heightened moral value to motherhood with pressure to become the perfect idealised mother and mothers compare themselves to such fantasies. There are ambiguities of love and hate within maternal relationship. Mothers may struggle to accept the negative feelings that they may have for their children due to fear of being judged by the society. When the conflicting feelings are experienced, it is the manner of dealing with them that evolves the sense of self. "Mothers are required to internalise the split between maternity and subjectivity by regulating and policing themselves qua maternal-bodied" (Stone 2012). One may find that the problem of maternal selfhood and subjectivity is universal and unchangeable. This is recognised by Kakar as well when he shares - with respect to motherhood- that irrespective of whether she is working or not, the Indian middle class woman's maternal role is not seen as an imposition but freely and joyfully chosen; motherhood remains the acme of a fulfilled life.

Gaiti questions herself, "*Why do I feel compelled to go on slogging?*" and in her question one finds a reflection of multitude mothers within Indian society. Rather than this struggle being located externally, it is more an internal one when it happens within the realm of family where one is up against generations of family values. There are ideals that one feels that one is competing against. These are struggles with feelings and it becomes a continuous struggle between love and concern, with demands of devotion and decency while Gaiti strives for respect as an individual and freedom to engage with what she wishes to. "*There is acknowledgment of others' nostalgia for 'family values' along with the struggle against unreason and coercion that masquerades as 'respect for elders'*". One is raised as a Muslim woman. The moment you are born you are inducted into a specific culture that defines you as a Muslim. One may constantly contest established notions in relationships to create options for oneself that will create a new legacy for one's daughter. "*With each act of negotiation, confrontation, conciliation and even compromise, I am writing the text for her unconscious.*" The maternal position develops with negotiation with both individual as well as social norms.

In fact, there are times when one may not want to be like own mother, and it is while one is raising one's daughter that it is realised how much alike one is to own mother. All through my adolescent years in fact till I gave birth to my daughter and stepped into the shoes of being a mother, I had failed to understand my mother as a woman. She remained a mother for longest time and it is from that position I judged her. It is during multiple interactions with my daughter that I am often cognisant of the revisit to the dilemmas that I now face being on the other side. My mother was particular of ensuring that I am demonstrating traits and behaviour of being a 'woman' by constantly checking on the way I walked, or talked softly. And now when I see my daughter, her words come back in my head. I often find myself that the image that I may want my daughter adapt is perhaps societal influence coming from past, not responding to the present. In such moments, two things happen. One re-visiting my understanding of the woman who was my mother and how much of my behaviour is reflective of her and other being the quick edit when I am able to catch what it is doing to me at present. These editing moments are critical as they are the weighing moments of me as a woman and a mother.

Gaiti's narrative highlighted that the tendency to believe that mothers occupied with their own emotions, responses and needs diminishes the capacity to care for others. It also puts motherhood in opposition to selfhood. This is being challenged, as only when one is able to negotiate one's own needs along with others that one is able to counter the fragmentation within. Stone (2012) proposes that as mothers if one is able to look back into our memories and see our mothers as figures of difference, then one would be able to take on the maternal identity distinct from the way it is generally as - to be responsible for child care.

Motherhood and the Other's Gaze

The second narrative included in this paper is that of Faiza which highlights the observation that “in relation to her child, the mother re-lives her past relation to her own mother differently because she considers that her child is a unique other, distinct from own mother. What happens is that the past and present becomes mutually constitutive to form a living unity, so that the present repeats the past in a new shape, in the process altering the past's internal significance” (Stone 2012). One manner of reliving is through the re-evaluation of maternal body relations, so that each daughter is able to look at herself as a subject as well as look at mother positively in a society. This allows retaining the connectivity with mother along with a sense of subjectivity, without which one will lose the ability to produce meaning. A woman also internalises the specific ideals of womanhood and monitors her behaviour carefully in order to guarantee her mother's love and approval upon which she is more than even dependent as she makes ready to leave home, most often through marriage.

It is in bodily relations that often ideals of womanhood are located and also where one finds that majority of mothers are prone to become susceptible to the ‘gaze’ of the others. They often lose confidence in their own judgment and values. They abdicate their authority to others, be it within their family or to the external world. Faiza's conflict as mother is predominantly around the negotiation with the ‘other’ in her mothering. She has chosen to be a homemaker after completing her Masters in Business Administration prioritising her family and children over career. Her mother, as against Gaiti's, completed her graduation from a reputed college in Delhi and got married immediately into a relatively religious family. The liberal natal family, Faiza shares, was probably the reason why her “*mother was a strict disciplinarian towards her children with respect to the religious practice. Her attempt was to ensure that her lack was not reflected onto her children and therefore there were strictures during Ramzan (month of fasting) and around offering of namaaz (prayers).*” This consciousness has transmitted to Faiza as well who is sensitive to how others around her interpret her mothering. She did not see her mother as a role model for herself while growing up and was reportedly closer to her father like Gaiti. Immediately, however, she said that “her mother trusted her” as if sharing this ambiguity towards her mother to a stranger was unacceptable. Faiza is found to be conscious and restrained in what she shares about her relationship with mother and mostly what is communicated is positive. It is when she talks about her relationship with her daughters that the contrast begins to emerge - whether it is the depth of relationship that she has developed with her daughters, or the manner in which she is able to make the friends of her daughters welcomed in her home. One suspects that this may be a compensation for her experience of lack of warmth while growing.

It is not easy for a mother to interact with her daughter as it requires broadening of boundaries and setting up of new ones which is both emotional and psychological upheaval for both. There is a desire to keep daughter proximal, a reflection of both her own psychic desire and social expectation (Beauvoir 2010). This may be one of the reasons or outcomes of the struggle to expand from the identity of being a woman to being a mother. Faiza finds herself in the dilemma of how she will be defined as a mother when she sees her independent daughters on the basis of their behaviour and deport. She lives in an apartment complex that is dominated by affluent Muslim families. The conversation of women is still dominated by ‘what are the good Muslim practices, especially for girls’. This leads to conflict at home where her fears of how will her daughters get married if they continue to behave contrary to ‘good practicing Muslim girls’ are questioned by daughters, “*after all what are others going to do? Will*

they have an affair with our husbands or what?" She vacillates between her desire to live up to the expectations of others and the freedom she has allowed to her daughters. Now she finds losing control and battles with her daughters. Their choices and opinions dominate her wishes and her life revolves around her daughters. She is unable to negotiate and sometimes conflict results in days of silence between them and always ends up giving in as she sees motherhood her life time role.

Her mother had taken care of her daughters when they were young and she sees the same role for herself. There exist feelings of being taken for granted, but even the expression of this feeling is immediately curtailed as per the expected role of motherhood. The dominance of "being a mother" subsumes any possibility of thinking about herself. In one rare poignant moment, she said *"there is much that I have suppressed. I have lived till now suppressing what I wanted to do, when I was young then it was parents who determined what I would do and what I became. Post marriage my life has revolved around my husband and daughters where I am somewhere at the periphery. I want to make use of what I have studied but I do not know what to do because when I do think about it I feel as if I am being unjust to my daughters. They need me."* Gaiti had also shared that there are multiple battles that arise between her and her daughter, but she is able to stand her ground as somewhere she falls back on her mothered experience. Her mother's established clear boundaries could not be negotiated. With her daughter she feels that even though boundaries are established, but they are more tested by her daughter that she had even contemplated to do with her own.

Conclusion

What was common to both women was that they both rarely find space to even reflect and express their desires and wonder about their own identity which may be separate from being a mother. Both women have negotiated their fragmentation between womanhood and motherhood differently. At one level, Faiza has chosen to respond to the norm of motherhood and diluting their Muslim identity to respond to the desires of her daughters. This is not to say that the conflict does not emerge, it does in her frequent interactions with her Muslim friends. Gaiti, on the other hand, holds onto her identity and hopes that the daughter will understand the value of her sacrifice when she grows up. It is psychologically significant as to what we think has happened and not so much on the basis of what has actually happened. The stories that we tell ourselves about our past and our lives are indispensable to keep our existing equilibrium of ever-precarious sense of well-being and self-worth. Many women may want to mother but their challenges may be about the way they imagine the role of mother to be. If re-imagination was possible then one would be able to deconstruct maternal subjectivity.

References

- Beauvoir, S. 2010. *The Second Sex*. London: Vintage Books.
- Benjamin, J. 1988. *The Bonds of Love: Psychoanalysis, Feminism & the Problem of Domination*. New York: Pantheon Books.
- Benjamin, J. 1995. *Like Subjects, Love Objects. Essays on Recognition and Sexual Difference*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Benjamin, J. 2000. "Response to Commentaries by Mitchell and by Butler." *Studies in Gender and Sexuality* 1(3): 291-308.
- Benjamin, J. 2004. "Beyond Doer and Done to: An intersubjective view of Thirdness." *The Psychoanalytic Quarterly* 73: 5-46.
- Bondi, L. 2014. "Understanding feelings: Engaging with unconscious communication and embodied knowledge." *Emotions, Space and Society* 10: 44-54.

- Johri, R. 1996. "Mother, Daughter, Women: Mother's Voices on Daughtering and Marriage." *Indian Psychologist* 30-36.
- Juhasz, S. 2003. "Mother Writing and the Narrative of Maternal Subjectivity." *Studies in Gender and Sexuality* 4(4): 395-425.
- Kakar, S. 1981. *The Inner World*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Kakar, S. & Kakar. K. 2007. *The Indians. Portrait of a People*. New Delhi: Penguin Books.
- Layton, L. 2008. "What divides the Subject? Psychoanalytic Reflection on Subjectivity, Subjection and Resistance." *Subjectivity* 22: 60-72.
- Reissman, C. K. 2001. "Analysis of Personal Narratives." In *Handbook of Interview Research: Context and Method*, edited by Jaber F. Gubrium, James A. Holsten, 695-710. California: Sage Publications.
- Reissman, C. K. 2005. "Narrative Analysis." In *Narrative, Memory & Everyday Life*, edited by Nancy Kelly, Christine Horrocks, Kate Milnes, Brian Roberts and David Robinson, 1-7. Huddersfield: University of Huddersfield.
- Stone, A. 2011. "Female Subjectivity and Mother-Daughter Relations." *Women: A Cultural Review* 22:(2-3): 168-179.
- Stone, A. 2012. *Feminism, Psychoanalysis, and Maternal Subjectivity*. New York: Routledge.
- Van Buren, J. 2007. *Mothers and Daughters and the Origin of Female Subjectivity*. New York: Routledge.